

## BOOK REVIEWS

**Hegel's Political Philosophy: Problems and Perspectives.** Ed. Z. A. Pelczynski (Cambridge: University Press, 1971. Pp. 246. \$14.50.)

This collection differs from some other recent collections of articles on Hegel by consisting exclusively of essays that have not appeared previously. *New Studies in Hegel's Philosophy* (1971), ed. Warren E. Steinkraus, offers fourteen studies, some old, some new; *Hegel's Political Philosophy* (1970), ed. Walter Kaufmann, ten, all of them published previously. The price one has to pay for insisting on contributions that have not appeared in print before is, of course, that some of the best known Hegel scholars are not represented because they lacked the time to write new pieces especially for this volume. Nevertheless, the cast is impressive. Apart from the editor who is the only writer represented by two essays (the first and the last), there are John Plamenatz (Oxford), W. H. Walsh (Edinburgh), and R. N. Berki (Hull) from the United Kingdom; J.-F. Suter and Eugène Fleischmann from Paris; K.-H. Ilting (Saar) and Manfred Riedel (Erlangen) from Germany; G. Heiman (Toronto); and Judith N. Shklar (Harvard), David E. Cooper (University of Miami), and D. P. Verene (Pennsylvania State University) from the U.S.

The level of scholarship throughout this volume is imposing. Nobody wrote his contribution "off the top of his head." The average number of footnotes per essay is more than sixty; most of the references are to Hegel's writings; and all of the contributors seem to feel very much at home with Hegel. The other side of that coin is that the volume makes pretty hard reading. It is not to be expected that many scholars, not to speak of others, will read the whole book from beginning to end. For that reason, the printing is small and the price staggering (\$14.50 for less than 250 pages, including a good index). The price will do its share to limit the audience.

In general, one may well wonder about the point of such books. The chief value of the present volume may be that it sets high standards of scholarship in a field in which shoddy scholarship has been all too widespread. Those who merely read some of the essays may still be immunized against the facile generalizations about Hegel's political philosophy that were considered respectable until quite recently.

It is nevertheless a pity that most of these articles are not more readable. The fault is neither Hegel's nor the editor's. Quotations from

Hegel do not stand out as curiosities in generally lucid prose, and the difficulty does not lie in sentences that have to be reread again and again. Instead most of the prose is simply drab, and there is rarely any sense of intellectual excitement. Anyone looking for crisply stated theses that are at variance with common "knowledge" but defended with at least a little virtuosity will certainly be disappointed by much of this volume.

Occasionally, the editor interposes brief footnotes calling attention to the fact that another contributor deals with the same problem on another page: thus Fleischmann says in passing that Hegel admired Antigone as the representative of individual conscience and conviction, while Shklar argues at some length that he did not see her that way and admired her for different reasons:

She never thought of herself as an individual expressing a personal morality. She spoke solely as a sister within an ethical family, as a social being, fulfilling a defined role. . . . She did not look into her heart or conscience to discover righteousness. She knew what had to be done, and always had known, because she was not making a moral choice, but obeying an unquestionable law. (p. 85).

The issue is never joined, and the title of Shklar's essay is "Hegel's '*Phenomenology*': An elegy for Hellas." Here, too, as in most of the essays, a theme is pursued, and it is not a matter of establishing a new view. E. M. Butler's bold book, *The Tyranny of Greece over Germany* (1935), was much more exciting. Not only was her theme newer then, but she rapidly covered a great deal of territory and showed us all of it in a willful but clearly defined and revelatory perspective.

The new book is a miscellany of scholarly articles. They deal with such topics as Hegel's conception of the state, his conception of history as the realization of freedom, the structure of his *Philosophy of Right*, his "corporate doctrine," his theory of punishment, and his account of war. Three pieces involve comparisons with other thinkers: "Burke, Hegel, and the French Revolution," "Perspectives in the Marxian critique of Hegel's political philosophy," and a very short article on Stirner, Marx, and Hegel. Anyone dealing with one of these topics would be well advised to consult the relevant essay. Anyone not dealing with one of these topics in the first place is not very likely to become excited about them by reading these essays. Nevertheless this volume evokes not only

respect but gratitude. It may well represent a milestone in the study of Hegel's political philosophy and the end of an era of irresponsibility. The picture of Hegel that emerges here bears little resemblance to the bogeyman presented to us by his detractors. Nor does the book revive the Hegel image of the British Idealists. The new portrait is much more accurate. But it does not capture the distinctive and often bizarre boldness of this unique thinker.

WALTER KAUFMANN

Princeton University

**From Karl Mannheim.** Edited and with an Introduction by Kurt H. Wolff. (New York: Oxford University Press, 1971. Pp. cxi, 393. \$12.50.)

In the 1920s Karl Mannheim's *Ideology and Utopia* created quite a stir among German intellectuals by showing that not only *what* men think politically but also *how* they think is conditioned by their social position. Mannheim developed a method of "sociology of knowledge" which enabled him to demonstrate the dependence of the *structure* of thought on the social position of the thinker. This, of course, was a refinement and at the same time a subtle overcoming of Marxist doctrine. Mannheim was one of the few sociologists who in Weimar Germany was able to develop a "school." One of his last efforts was an attempt to gain official recognition for sociology as a "teachable" discipline.

After his flight from the Nazi Regime, Mannheim contributed to the development of sociology as a field of university instruction in England, where it had hardly gained a foothold at the London School of Economics and none at Oxford and Cambridge. The present selection from his writings covers both periods. The essays have been available in English before, except one which is given in Wolff's translation (*Problems of Sociology in Germany*).

Kurt H. Wolff, already known as editor and interpreter of Georg Simmel's works gives in his Introduction of more than one hundred thirty pages a veritable "course" on Mannheim in which he explains the origin, intention, and significance of each of Mannheim's major writings, including many not contained in this selection. The well-chosen readings will give the student an idea of Mannheim's work, which is the main purpose of a collection of this type.

The Introduction is the really new feature of the book. The author discusses Mannheim's major writings in chronological order, inserting in some instances long passages from papers not included in the Reader. The arrangement

may seem rather dull at first glance, but it is not, for Wolff uses it to demonstrate the development of Mannheim's thinking. Like many of the earlier great sociologists, Mannheim started out not as a sociologist but as a philosopher with predominant interest in epistemology. When, after his migration from Hungary to Germany, he turned to sociology, it was the recently opened field of sociology of knowledge which he mainly cultivated and in which he gained an international reputation. His contributions were by no means restricted to methodological discourses but included empirical inquiries as well. Of these the essays on "Conservative Thought" and on "Democratization of Culture" are likely to be of major interest to political scientists, as would also be the essay on "The Problem of Generations" which is *not* included in the readings but is summarized in the Introduction.

After his flight to England, Mannheim changed his concerns, as is well known among students of his later work. More than ever before opposed to any kind of totalitarian regime, he became increasingly concerned with the possibilities (and necessity) of planning in a democratic society, the problem being the preservation of freedom and human dignity in a planned economy.

Wolff's Introduction is a profound, empathic and at the same time critical piece of what may be called intellectual biography. It covers more ground and goes deeper into the matter than Paul Kecskemeti's short but competent introduction to the British publication "Essays on Sociology and Social Psychology" of 1953. It must be said that Wolff does not make it easy, at least not for readers who are unfamiliar with the problems of epistemology and sociology of knowledge. One is tempted to say, what is called "introduction" is rather an analytical, interpretive, and critical essay to be read after the "readings," or at least as an accompaniment. Finally, one wishes that instead of keeping the discourse mainly within the framework set by Mannheim's work, the author had said more about the intellectual and academic milieu in which Mannheim's ideas developed. In that way such seemingly "dry" and "dated" pieces as the lecture on the "Tasks of Sociology" (p. lxxvi ff.) would gain life. For this reviewer, who was present when it was delivered, it was a great and unforgettable experience.

RUDOLF HEBERLE

Baton Rouge, Louisiana

**Critique of Hegel's Philosophy of Right.** By Karl Marx. Edited by Joseph O'Malley (Cam-